

The University of Newcastle



Faculty of Business and Law

Newcastle Graduate School of Business

**A Study of the Impact of Management Philosophy on
HR Practices and Employee Attitudes and
Performance in Two Chinese Manufacturing
Organizations: A Case Study Approach**

By

Wai Kau Alphaeus Tam (談 偉 球)

MSc. (Eng) (HKU, HK)

MBA (Surrey, UK)

BSc. (Hons) (OUHK, HK)

Submitted for the degree of Doctor of Business Administration

JUNE 2013

To my wife, Frances Ip, the love of my life,
To my daughter, Annie Tam, my pride and joy.

STATEMENT OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP

This dissertation contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my dissertation, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

_____ Date : 15 August 2013

TAM, Wai Kau Alphaeus (談 偉 球)

MSc(Eng) (HKU, HK), MBA (Surry, UK),
BSc(Hons) (OUHK, HK)

MHKQMA, SrMHKSQ, SrMASQ (USA), MPMI (USA), SrMIIE (USA)

中國六西格瑪黑帶認證教師

中國註冊六西格瑪黑帶

中國註冊質量經理

Registered Quality Manager, New Zealand

Registered Quality Manager, HK

Certified Supply Chain Manager, USA

Certified Lean Master, USA

Registered Quality Professional (Master Six Sigma Black Belt), HK

Registered Quality Professional (Lean Six Sigma Black Belt), HK

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First of all, my special thanks go to my wife, Frances and my daughter, Annie. I would like to thank them for their tolerance of many absences from family life, while I was also away my business trips or hidden away in my study, as well as practical and moral encouragement, understanding and patience throughout the dissertation period.

I would like to thank my supervisors Dr. Antony Drew and Dr. Timothy Bartram who have given invaluable and innumerable suggestions and comments throughout the whole dissertation process. I am especially thankful to Dr Antony Drew, who gave me more valuable advice. I could not have been completed the dissertation without his support when I felt lonely during my dissertation journey. Moreover, he also provided me with useful techniques for qualitative research in relation to the case study approach. I also thank HKMA course coordinators for their kind assistance in providing me with some useful guidelines for both coursework and dissertation submission.

I am very grateful to all participants who gave their invaluable time and effort to interview activity and to the HR department of each organisation who assisted in coordinating its interviews for data collection. I particularly thank the employees of the two manufacturing organisations who provided me with so much information in an open and helpful manner.

Finally, one of the most pleasant parts of writing this dissertation was the opportunity to thank those who have contributed to it. Without the help and support from these people, this dissertation could not have been completed.

古之學者必有師。所以傳道受業解惑也。人非而知之者，孰能無惑？惑而不從師，其為惑也，終不解矣。

“弟子不必不如師，師不必賢於弟子，聞道有先後，術業有專攻”

師說 韓愈

Table of Contents

	Page
TITLE PAGE	
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY AUTHORSHIP	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iii
SYNOPSIS	viii
 CHAPTER ONE - INTRODUCTION	
1.0 Background to the research	1
1.1 Research focus	2
1.2 Justification for the research	3
1.3 Research gaps and research question	4
1.4 Research methodology and design overview	5
1.5 Dissertation outline	8
1.6 Research definitions	8
1.7 Research scope, delimitation, key assumptions	9
1.8 Conclusion	10
 CHAPTER TWO - LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.0 Introduction	11
2.1 General concept of management philosophy	12
2.2 Western management philosophy	13
2.3 Mainstream doctrines of Western management philosophy	14
2.3.1 Declaration of Independence – Thomson Jefferson	16
2.3.2 ‘Invisible hand’ in free economy and division of labour – Adam Smith	16
2.3.3 The Protestant work ethic and Judeo-Christian values	17
2.3.4 Bureaucracy – Max Weber	19
2.3.5 Scientific management – Frederick W. Taylor	19
2.3.6 General administrative theory – Henri Fayol	21
2.3.7 Motivation theories	21
2.4 Culture and management philosophy	27
2.5 Preamble on Chinese philosophy	29
2.6 Mainstream doctrines of Chinese philosophy	30
2.6.1 Legalism 法家– Han Fei 韓非	30
2.6.2 Confucianism 儒家– Kongzi 孔子	32
2.6.3 Taoism 道家– Lao Tzu 老子	35
2.6.4 Summary of selected Chinese philosophies	38
2.6.5 Cultural aspects in Chinese manufacturing organisations	40

		Page
2.6.6	The impact of Chinese philosophy on Chinese management philosophy	42
2.6.7	Western management philosophy in Chinese manufacturing organisations	43
2.7	Conceptual framework developed for this research	43
2.8	Research gap and research questions	45

CHAPTER THREE - RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND DESIGN

3.0	Introduction	47
3.1	Background to the research methodology and design	47
3.2	Alternative research methods in qualitative research	48
3.2.1	Narrative research	48
3.2.2	Phenomenology	48
3.2.3	Grounded theory	49
3.2.4	Ethnography	49
3.2.5	Case Study	49
3.3	Research design	50
3.4	Data collection strategy	51
3.4.1	Sampling strategy	53
3.4.2	Units of analysis	54
3.4.3	Language strategy	54
3.4.4	Interview strategy	54
3.4.5	Interview procedure and process	56
3.5	Pilot study and feedback from pilot study	58
3.6	Main study	59
3.7	Validity and reliability	59
3.7.1	Credibility	60
3.7.2	Dependability and consistency	60
3.7.3	Confirmability	61
3.7.4	Triangulation	61
3.8	Limitations of the research	62
3.9	Researcher's credibility	62
3.10	Ethical considerations	63
3.11	Conclusion	63

CHAPTER FOUR - DATA ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

4.0	Introduction	64
4.1	Demographic and background information	64
4.1.1	Background findings on firms from secondary data	65
4.1.2	Demographics of senior management	67
4.1.3	Demographics of the focus group interviews	68
4.2	Research assumptions	69
4.3	Data coding	69

	Page
4.4 Analysis of the data and findings	70
4.4.1 Theme 1: Transfer of management messages	71
4.4.2 Theme 2: Effect of top-down communication style on employee attitudes	78
4.4.3 Theme 3: The impact of management philosophy on HR practise on employee perceptions and performance	81
4.5 Discussion from research data in this study	85
4.6 Summary	88

CHAPTER FIVE - CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

5.0 Introduction	89
5.1 Conclusions from the research findings	90
5.2 Implications from the research findings	92
5.3 Limitations and recommendations	93
5.4 Further research directions	94
5.4.1 Different countries and regions	94
5.4.2 Alternative methods to study management philosophy	95
5.4.3 Alternative scenarios in Chinese manufacturing firms	95
5.5 Summary	96

List of references	98
---------------------------	----

Appendices

Appendix A Invitation letter sent to selected organisation	113
Appendix B Interview questions for the research project	114
Appendix C Template of interview data sheet	116
Appendix D Ethical clearance approval	117
Appendix E Letter and information statement sent to interview participants	120
Appendix F Participant consent form	125

List of figures		page
Figure 1.1	Flowchart of this research study	7
Figure 2.1	The conceptual framework developed for this research	45

List of tables	Page
Table 2.1 Summary of selected Chinese philosophies	39
Table 3.1 Data collection sources	54
Table 3.2 Similarities and differences in research framework	55
Table 3.3 Distribution of interview and focus group meeting participants	57
Table 3.4 Themes and codes developed for this research	57
Table 4.1 Participant identification system	65
Table 4.2 Summary of the results of key documentations	67
Table 4.3 Summary of demography of focus group participants	68
Table 4.4 Summary of general information of focus group participants	69
Table 4.5 Themes, codes and related questions	71
Table 4.6 Summary of findings from the analysis	87

SYNOPSIS

The objective of this research is to provide insight into the impact of Chinese and Western management philosophies on HR practices in Chinese manufacturing organisations in China and subsequent organisational and employee performance. This research follows a case study approach. It investigates the management philosophies and HR practices of two very similar manufacturing firms in Shenzhen, China. Both firms engage in original brand manufacturing (OBM) of the same products, both employ approximately 3,000 local Chinese operator level staff and both produce finished products for export. The key difference between the firms is that one is a subsidiary of an American Multinational Corporation that adopts a Western management philosophy and HR practices; whereas the other is Chinese owned and adopts a Chinese management philosophy and HR practices. This empirical, qualitative study aims to answer the following research questions through a multi-level qualitative case study methodology:

- (1) How does management philosophy impact the use and implementation of HRM in a Chinese context?
- (2) How is management philosophy understood, implemented and operationalized in a foreign MNE operating in China and a Chinese-owned enterprise; and what are the differences and similarities across these areas in these two organisations?
- (3) What practices are most beneficial in increasing employee and organisational performance in manufacturing firms in China?

In relation to research question 1, this study finds that in the case of OBM in China, HR practices influenced by a Western management philosophy have a negative impact on operator level workplace attitudes, perceptions and performance. Conversely, HR practices influenced by a Chinese management philosophy have a positive effect on the same factors. This suggests that at least in the context of OBM in China, the management philosophy enacted by senior management needs to be congruent with the values, attitudes and beliefs of the workers.

In relation to research question 2, this study finds that local Chinese employees in the Western-oriented firm did not fully understand the HR directives from top management and were not willing or able to work effectively, even though they were given specific detailed instructions, clearly written in Chinese characters. Conversely, employees in the Chinese-oriented firm clearly understood general messages and directives from top management without such explicit instructions and were more willing and able to work effectively.

Finally, in relation to research question 3, this research suggest that the practice most beneficial in increasing employee and organisational performance in manufacturing firms in China is to implement a management philosophy and HR practices that are congruent with the values, attitudes and beliefs of all employees.

Keywords:

Chinese philosophy, Western management philosophy, employee attitudes, organisational performance and case study.